



Scrutiny Report

Report of the Economic Development
& Corporate Issues Scrutiny Panel
Greening the workplace - revisit

September 2010



CONTENTS

	Page
Foreword from the Chair.....	3
Background and scope of the review	4
Recommendations.....	5
Findings	7
Conclusion.....	14
 Appendices	
Membership of the Panel	18

FOREWORD FROM THE CHAIR



Councillor Ishaq Jawaid MBE
Chair of the Economic Development and
Corporate Issues Scrutiny Panel

I have pleasure in presenting the Economic Development and Corporate Issues Scrutiny Panel's revisit report into Greening the Workplace. This report looks at progress four years on from a scrutiny review into the council's environmental policies and practices. The panel has found many examples of where the local situation has improved. However, we remain concerned that, in some key areas, this progress has not been as concerted or as co-ordinated as required.

As Chair of the panel, I would like to take the opportunity to thank the Vice-Chairman and all of the members who were involved in this revisit for their hard work and dedication. I would also like to thank my predecessor, Cllr Allan Smith, for his initial leadership on this issue.

It is widely recognised that climate change is one of the key challenges for the world. The 2006 Stern Review concluded that "climate change presents very serious global risks, and it demands an urgent global response." At a more local level, the Regional Climate Plan highlights that Yorkshire and the Humber is seriously exposed to climate change. Our carbon emissions within North Lincolnshire are amongst the highest in the country.

As Chair of the scrutiny panel I hope this report goes some way to dealing with this vitally important issue. I look forward, with my scrutiny colleagues, to closely monitoring progress.

BACKGROUND & SCOPE OF THE REVIEW

The members of the panel felt that it would be timely to revisit the 2006 report Greening the Workplace for a number of reasons. Firstly, revisiting previous work is considered good practice, as it enables scrutiny members to monitor progress and to hold the council's executive to account.

From 1 April 2010, the council is also beginning to operate within a pilot period of carbon trading. This means that the council will have to work within the national Carbon Reduction Commitment Energy Efficiency Scheme, with potential fines of up to £300,000 a year if targets are not met. However, if the council exceeds its targets, it can trade these on the open market, potentially making a profit.

Meeting the challenge of climate change is a huge task, and the panel believes strongly that North Lincolnshire Council must play its part by reducing emissions and encourage others to do likewise.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The final recommendations of the panel are summarised below:

Recommendation 1

That appropriate officers produce an annual energy and water usage report for consideration by Council, including within the 2010/11 municipal year.

Recommendation 2

The panel recommends that volunteer wardens are re-introduced as a matter of some urgency, with communication and co-ordination led by the council-wide Carbon Management Group. The panel believes that the Chair and all members of this group take all appropriate action to ensure the long-term viability of the volunteer warden scheme.

Recommendation 3

The panel recommends that every service area strive to achieve ISO 14001 accreditation over the next three years. The panel further recommends that this be co-ordinated by the Climate Change Steering Group, in consultation with the Carbon Management Group. The panel expects that the Chief Executive and the council's Leadership Team would take ownership and drive progress on this issue, taking any action as appropriate. As such, members recommend that the Chief Executive provide a full progress report back to the scrutiny panel twelve months after this report is considered by Council.

Recommendation 4

The panel recommends that consideration be given to amalgamating the work of the

Climate Change Steering Group and the Carbon Management Group in order to prevent duplication.

Recommendation 5

The panel recommends that the Carbon Management Group consider whether introducing targets for individual service areas, based on current energy emissions, are an appropriate method for reducing usage and increasing accountability at service level.

Recommendation 6

The panel recommends that during the 2010/11 municipal year the council, with support from relevant partners and specialists, conduct a Performance Improvement Panel on the combined elements of NI 185, NI 186 and NI 194. Members would expect the usual follow-up processes and action planning to occur following the Performance Improvement Panel's work.

Recommendation 7

The panel recommends that the council's Fleet Manager, with appropriate support, conduct a green fleet review, making short, medium and long-term recommendations to improve green transportation to the council's Cabinet, Leadership Team and appropriate Heads of Service, as deemed appropriate.

Recommendation 8

The panel recommends that the Fleet Manager plays a key, strategic role towards improving the council's environmental performance on transportation.

Recommendation 9

The panel recommends that the Council's Cabinet and appropriate Service Directors consider implementing a corporate policy where all service requests for fleet provision or transportation include a consideration of environmental impact and sustainability, as guided by the Fleet Manager. Consideration should also be given to extending powers to the Fleet Manager to veto requests for specific vehicles where a cheaper, more energy efficient or sustainable alternative with a comparable specification exists.

Recommendation 10

The panel recommends that the council continue to forge links with all schools in North Lincolnshire, in order to improve energy efficiency, and to reduce costs and emissions. The panel feels that a two-part approach should be utilised. Firstly, informal discussions should continue, and the council's Energy Manager be invited to address future meetings of Primary Heads, Secondary Headteachers and Principals and school business managers in order to explain the potential benefits, funding and other options. Secondly, where Display Energy Certificate ratings are poor, or there are concerns around data quality, the council may wish to consider including energy considerations within negotiations of each school's Service Level Agreement.

Recommendation 11

The panel recommends that a prominent feature promoting the local Travellincs scheme be prepared by officers and included in Direct magazine within the 2010/11 municipal year.

Recommendation 12

The panel recommends that the Council's Cabinet seek evidence-based assurances from officers across the council and other partners, that all necessary action is taking place to ensure suitable training, education and vocational opportunities are available within North Lincolnshire to match the future needs of the expanding green technology sector.

Recommendation 13

The panel recommends that a regular agenda item on environmental considerations be placed on the agenda of each Culture Improvement Team across the council, supported by the regular provision of energy usage, emissions etc. wherever possible.

FINDINGS

1. Context

This report is intended to bring together several fundamental issues. Firstly, as stated by the United Nations, “climate change is already happening, is unequivocal, and this change can now be firmly attributed to human activity”. The impact of climate change to the UK and the wider world has the potential to be catastrophic, with major damage to the ecosystem, the planet’s climate and the lives of billions of people.

At a more local level, North Lincolnshire is a major contributor to the CO2 emissions in the region, largely due to continued reliance on fossil fuels. The council also has rising energy costs; money which could be better spent on providing services to local people. It is essential that North Lincolnshire Council, as a local leader, helps to reduce costs to local people, lower emissions and tackles climate change. Further, it is important to provide an example to others to contribute to the international efforts to mitigate the effects of climate change.

2. General

There has been much work undertaken since the original Greening the Workplace review in 2006. Most notably, the council adopted the Climate Change Action Plan in March 2007 and the Carbon Management Plan in February 2010. The council has an ambitious local target to reduce carbon emissions by 33% over the five years of the Carbon Management Plan. There is also a challenging target to reduce CO2 emissions by 12% over three years across the entire Local Strategic Partnership.

This section of the report is arranged into two parts. Firstly, an analysis of the Cabinet’s response to the scrutiny panel’s 2006 recommendations, followed by some discussion of other environmental issues that were discussed by members during the revisit.

3. Response to the Scrutiny Panel’s original 2006 recommendations.

Recommendation 1.

That the council, as a community and business leader, ensures that it adheres to all its environmental commitments that were agreed at its cabinet meeting on 19th October 2006.

This is perhaps the key recommendation from the original report, and there are many areas of encouraging progress with this recommendation. However, some commitments require further work. These are summarised in the table on page 8.

Recommendation 2.

That the council draft an action plan in response to the Nottingham Declaration on Climate Change, stating how it intends to meet targets for reduced emissions and adapting to climate change.

The council’s Cabinet agreed a comprehensive Climate Change Action Plan in March 2007 and the Carbon Management Plan in February 2010. This provided a response to the Nottingham Declaration.

Commitment	Progress
1. Minimisation of energy and water usage and responsible energy management	Some progress with plans to improve metering, reduce heating levels in main buildings. However, there is still a fundamental lack of base information and energy usage measurement. This is discussed in more depth later in the report.
2. Minimisation of waste products and the promotion of recycling	Recycling facilities are now available across most sites. Links have been developed to the waste contracts.
3. Purchase of environmentally friendly products and services	The council is currently at level 3 of the Environmental Procurement programme, working towards the top level (level 5) by 2015. The council, in partnership with North East Lincolnshire Council, has been nationally recognised by regional government, specialist media and others for their work in this area.
4. Work with others to protect and enhance the natural environment, encouraging community awareness and participation.	A Biodiversity Plan has been agreed with Lincolnshire Trust, and several local sites are under development, such as the Conesby Blue Lagoon, Ashbyville and Alkborough.
5. Protect and enhance the built environment	There has been a review of all conservation areas, and the council continues to work to all relevant legislation and guidance.
6. Promote sustainable, environmentally friendly transportation	Work is ongoing, aligned to the development of a revised Local Transport Plan. Green Transport Plans and action to reduce car usage remain underdeveloped across the council, although there is some work underway to address this, notably the economical driving courses discussed on page 9.
7. Minimise and monitor all forms of pollution, ensuring the principle that the polluter should pay	Some action underway, particularly around dealing with land contamination. The existing Contaminated Land Strategy is currently being refreshed. Resources remain an issue.
8. Raise awareness and encourage wide participation in environmental issues.	Some encouraging work to engage local people to support schemes in Atkinson's Warren, Alkborough Flats and in general environmental husbandry has been developed.
9. Work with local communities to encourage good environmental practices	See the response to recommendation 8 (above).
10. Reduce carbon emissions by the council and the whole of North Lincolnshire	The council has now adopted a comprehensive Carbon Management Plan and established a Climate Change Steering Group and a Carbon Management Group. However, carbon emissions across all of North Lincolnshire remain far too high and, locally, we are one of the poorest performing areas in the country.

Recommendation 3.

That the council, in its community leadership capacity, promotes and provides the opportunity for all its employees to recycle waste from all council buildings. For example, at Pittwood House, cardboard disposal boxes are situated on each floor, which allows employees to recycle aluminium and plastic.

Recycling for a number of materials was rolled out to all council buildings and schools in November 2008. The recycled material from schools also contributes to the council's targets on recycling.

Recommendation 4.

That all employees be reminded that they have a duty to use all the council's resources as efficiently as possible to minimise costs.

Employee Development Reviews (EDRs) for all staff now include an generic competency element on maintaining environmental good practice at work, with all staff required to meet set standards. A new council campaign is also due to begin in the autumn, working in partnership with the Energy Saving Trust, to ensure all staff are aware of this issue. A pilot driver training programme is also currently being piloted, before roll-out to all fleet drivers.

Recommendation 5.

That for all new housing developments, the council considers attaching a planning condition which states that at least 10 % of energy requirements for new developments come from renewable sources.

This recommendation has largely been superseded by government guidance and legislation issued in the interim period. A revised planning policy was presented to the council's Planning Committee in June 2010, who have recommended that the council adopts a code for all new housing to meet the sustainable homes standard and all commercial developments to produce 20% of expected energy demand from renewable sources. It is expected that this will lead to improvements in local carbon emissions and the council's performance against relevant indicators.

Recommendation 6.

That the council creates an Energy Management Working Group consisting of representatives from each council service and all its major buildings.

In June 2009 the council established a Climate Change Steering Group. This is chaired by the Cabinet Member for Highways, Planning and Energy, and includes key members and officers. A Carbon Management Group has also recently been established with officer representation from all service areas across the council. This group is designed to plan and monitor progress on the Carbon Management Plan. However, there is no building-specific representation, as outlined in the recommendation.

Recommendation 7.

That each building manager throughout the council be asked to produce an energy action plan identifying how each building can reduce

energy consumption. The target to be set by the Energy Management Working Group.

The panel heard that each council building over 1000 square metres is legally obliged to display an energy certificate containing an operational rating showing actual annual carbon dioxide emissions from the building and other information. This rating is shown on a scale from A to G, where A is the lowest (best) and G is the highest (worst). Each certificate is accompanied by a seven-year Advisory Report, which contains recommendations for improving the energy performance of the building. Key sites were surveyed by the Carbon Trust in 2007 and there are now 105 sites that are surveyed on an annual basis (including school sites). Much of this information has been fed into the Carbon Management Plan and is used to prioritise improvement work. Despite this, there may be issues with the data quality provided at some sites.

Another key piece of work is the roll-out of smart metering across sites. This enables building specific monitoring of energy usage across all sites (where technically possible), and provides much improved intelligence in order to target and prioritise future work. Around 120 smart electricity meters have been installed to date, providing around 40% coverage. Plans are currently being formulated to roll-out many more meters, including gas.

Recommendation 8.

That the Energy Management Working Group produce an annual energy and water report for consideration by Council.

This recommendation has not been adopted by the council's executive. Despite this, there is increasing use of energy consumption data in the council's annual report.

Recommendation 9.

That the Energy Management Working Group explore the possibility of introducing energy wardens in each council building.

Some initial work had been completed in early 2007, establishing groups of volunteer energy wardens for each of the main council buildings. However, these groups tended to be under-utilised and subsequently dissolved. Recently, steps were taken to reconnect with interested volunteers and to re-launch this scheme, and to also link with the Sustainable Schools initiative.

Recommendation 10.

That the Energy Management Working Group undertake a survey of each council building to determine whether they continue to use energy efficiently.

As discussed above, all relevant council buildings have now been surveyed in line with legislation and an accompanying energy certificate prepared.

Recommendation 11.

The committee would like to see every service area strive to achieve ISO 14001 accreditation. However, the committee learnt that service areas will need to find resources to do so. Nevertheless, savings in the use of other resources, including energy use could potentially offset some costs.

ISO 14001 was first published in 1996 by the International Organization for Standardization (ISO) and specifies the requirements for an environmental management system. It applies to those environmental aspects which organisations have control and over which it can be expected to have an influence.

Generally, there has been little corporate compliance with achieving ISO 14001 across the council. Many individual service plans include considerations of sustainability, biodiversity and carbon management, although only two services (Highways and Planning, and Neighbourhood and Environmental Services) are wholly accredited. Several other services are part compliant or are working through the accreditation process, although full accreditation is some way off, with no clear plan to achieve it.

Recommendation 12.

That the council, as part of the budget process, consider creating a separate budget to be used solely for the introduction and installation of renewable energies in existing council buildings.

Historically, there has been little progress on this recommendation until Council agreed its budget on 24 February 2010, where £500,000 was agreed to support the implementation of the Carbon Management Plan, with an additional £100,000 to prepare to trade carbon credits. The council's Carbon Management Plan states that there is the potential to save eleven and a half million pounds over the next five years. Despite this, the panel heard that a mechanism for improved co-ordination on environmental and carbon issues needed to be developed. The council has, in the past, tried to plan environmental work using staff or funding from numerous sources.

Recommendation 13.

That the council consider if one temporary post in the Energy Management Unit is sufficient in helping the council reduce its energy consumption.

The council appointed a dedicated Energy Manager in September 2009, whose post is 'self-financing' through the identification of potential financial savings to the council's energy usage. Before this time, it has been acknowledged by witnesses that progress had "stalled" to some extent. The council has also tended to rely heavily on one key officer, with a small team, for a lead on many environmental issues. A review of the structure of this team is underway and there are plans to align budgets. However, many of the forthcoming challenges require genuine corporate ownership and leadership.

Recommendation 14.

That the council implements a mechanism to ensure consistency and a 'one council' approach on corporate impacts (energy and water use, procurement, vehicle use and green travel etc.) auditing and accreditation. If the council intends to maintain this commitment, a timetable and appropriate resources will need to be identified in each service area.

The Carbon Management Plan has been designed to ensure a "one council" approach, and the Carbon Management Group and Climate Change Steering Group have been given the task of ensuring it is implemented. Arrangements are underway or in place to secure funding for the steps necessary to secure the required reduction in carbon emissions, energy efficiency, etc. However, there may be a need to introduce departmental carbon targets in order to encourage work across the council, freeing up potential savings.

Concern was raised by witnesses that, despite the importance of the issue, it was still seen as a priority for only a few services within the council. A consistent view was expressed that there is a need for real corporate leadership to co-ordinate and drive this forward.

Recommendation 15.

That a scrutiny committee re-visits this review in a year's time to monitor the progress being made by the council as it attempts to green the workplace.

This report constitutes the panel's scrutiny re-visit of the original report. Members may well choose to conduct future work on greening the workplace, carbon management, or a North Lincolnshire-wide review of carbon emissions. The panel are minded to request an interim report in six months, before revisiting the issue again in twelve months.

4. Additional Issues

During the panel's evidence gathering, several other issues were raised. Whilst these are often related to the previous recommendations and subsequent discussions, members felt that it was important to highlight them here.

Generally, much has been achieved in the time since the original scrutiny report and, in many ways, the situation has moved on from greening the workplace to a much wider carbon management agenda. Despite this, the principles remain relevant. As a major carbon user, ensuring the council's processes are sufficient, effective and efficient can undoubtedly lead to significant financial and environmental savings.

Whilst the council has made improvements, there remains a need for cultural change, and co-ordinated corporate leadership. Links between some of the major services are still under-developed, and there will be an increasing focus on leading on a North Lincolnshire-wide approach and the adaptation to a carbon trading economy. The Carbon Management Plan is crucial to these aims. In addition, as the council progresses its transformation agenda, it is likely that many staff will be encouraged to work more flexibly as part of the ongoing WorkSmart agenda. This should help to reduce carbon usage, as commuting reduces and buildings are rationalised.

The transport sector, nationally, contributes 21% of the total domestic greenhouse gas emissions. Therefore, the government has

recognised that transport will have to make a significant contribution towards the national target to reduce greenhouse gas emissions by 80% on 1990 levels by 2050 and by 34% on 1990 levels by 2020 (the Climate Change Act 2008).

As such, as part of the new Local Transport Plan 3 process the government introduced 5 key goals including 'Reducing Carbon Emissions.' The council is currently preparing its third Local transport Plan, which runs from April 2011 until 2026 and is aligned to the Sustainable Community Strategy. Work is underway on a number of important themes, including improving the transport infrastructure to enable the South Humber Gateway to reach its full potential, regional co-ordination, sustainable modes of transport, and the impact of new major developments.

When considering North Lincolnshire as a whole, our per capita CO₂ emissions are one of the worst in the country. North Lincolnshire has particular problems with industrial CO₂ emissions, where we are ranked 411 out of 440 UK local authority areas. For domestic use, we are 352nd and for road transport 341st. When all of these elements are combined, North Lincolnshire ranks second bottom in the country. Whilst the panel notes the comprehensive action plan to tackle this, it remains a major concern locally, with a potentially adverse impact on people's health and wellbeing, the reputation of the area and the availability of reward grants.

CONCLUSION

The panel notes encouraging progress in several areas related to the green agenda. Steps have been taken in the past year to implement two key groups to monitor the Climate Change Action Plan and to coordinate Carbon Management. The council has also agreed an excellent Carbon Management Plan that acts as an overarching and guiding document for many aspects of this vitally important agenda.

Despite this, the panel was concerned that progress on other issues remained far too slow and that action across the council remained variable. Until recently, most council services (including some central to the issue) were unrepresented on the relevant group. The panel feels that a culture remains where carbon management and action to tackle climate change is considered to be the responsibility of a few key services, or indeed, a handful of key officers and members. Clearly, this is unacceptable.

The panel notes with concern the lack of progress on several of the recommendations in the original Greening the Workplace report from 2006. In turn, these are the addressed below.

The council's cabinet agreed in October 2006 a commitment for "the minimisation of energy and water usage and responsible energy management". As described on page 11, the panel notes the progress made by the Energy Manager since his appointment.

However, the panel still has major concerns about the lack of baseline measurements of energy usage in the majority of the council's buildings. For electricity, there is approximately 40% smart meter coverage, and the figure for gas is even lower. The use of metering for water and oil remains significantly under-utilised. Clearly, without a comprehensive method of measuring energy usage, the council cannot effectively monitor how much energy is used at all sites, or have the necessary information to take appropriate steps to reduce this usage.

The original report also included a recommendation that an annual report on energy and water usage be prepared and presented to full council. It was felt that this would enable full democratic oversight of this important issue, increase transparency, and enable good practice to be shared. Whilst there has been an increase in the amount of information on energy use and costs in the council's annual report, this is a largely technical document that is not routinely accessible to members and the public.

Whilst the panel notes the shortcomings in measurement, as described in previous paragraphs, members believe that the original recommendation was sound. It is therefore reiterated (with slight alterations), and we look forward to receiving a full report at full council in the 2010/11 municipal year.

The original report also made a recommendation to establish volunteer energy wardens in each council building. As described on page 10, informal groups were established in 2007, but a lack of co-ordination and utilisation led to them breaking up. The panel heard that steps are underway to re-engage, re-introduce and co-ordinate these wardens. Despite this, the panel is clear that volunteer wardens shouldn't replace individual responsibility for energy usage, and members are glad to note the increased focus on environmental issues within EDRs for all staff (see page 9).

The panel also notes a worrying lack of progress on the recommendation for every service to strive to achieve ISO 14001 (see pages 10 and 11 for a description). Whilst the panel notes that all services are now represented on the Carbon Management Group, most services have made little progress in achieving ISO 14001. Given the major financial and environmental costs that relate to this agenda, the panel is clear that this is an issue that requires real corporate and political leadership to progress. The council cannot realistically hope to positively influence other partners on environmental matters without progress across the whole of the council. Again, the panel reiterates the original recommendation, and in this case, builds upon it.

Whilst it is clear that climate change and carbon management is "everyone's business", witnesses repeatedly highlighted the need for a centralised resource of specialist

practitioners. Their role would be to provide technical guidance and support to all service areas. The panel is encouraged that a recent restructure is moving some way to address this.

Whilst the coalition government has repeatedly advocated a move away from targets and indicators, the panel believes that the forthcoming carbon trading scheme will require a robust method to measure emissions, and to seek to reduce them in coming years. It may well be appropriate to utilise local targets for each of the council's service areas, so they can understand their energy usage and prepare plans to reduce carbon emissions, with guidance from the central resource described above if necessary. As described on page 13, performance on CO₂ emissions within North Lincolnshire is notably poor. Domestic, industrial and road transport emissions are all far too high, and threaten the ability of the council and its partners to meet their requirements and the aims of the Carbon Management Plan.

The panel believes a review of current and proposed actions, undertaken by suitably qualified and senior figures, would prove a useful method of identifying where progress could be made.

The council's fleet of vehicles was responsible for emitting 1.18 million kilograms of CO₂ in 2008/09, consisting of some 5.9 million miles of travel. Reducing these figures would go some way to reducing emissions across North Lincolnshire, and potentially, to encourage

more sustainable or healthy transport. This goal fits into the aims of The Climate Change Act 2008 and the draft third Local Transport Plan, as described on page 13.

However, the panel heard that the Fleet Manager's main current role is to facilitate the provision of requested transport for services across the council. The panel shares witnesses' view that the Fleet Manager should play a more central, strategic role in promoting, encouraging or even requiring services to utilise greener transport options.

Each of the school sites across North Lincolnshire will emit carbon and add to the cumulative emissions across the area. The council can play a key role in supporting schools to become more energy efficient, reducing emissions and saving money. The council's agreed "invest to save" approach described on page 11 applies equally to schools, and a range of support is available to all schools across North Lincolnshire. Despite this, schools' semi-autonomous status means that it can, on occasion, make access to surveying of current energy infrastructure and other site-specific information difficult.

Witnesses highlighted that they would be very willing to work with all schools in order to evaluate current facilities, provide tailored ideas and costs for improvements, signpost schools to funding mechanisms, etc. The panel heard clear evidence that relatively minor work can have a large impact on energy efficiency, emissions and finances.

As described on page 13, transportation makes up a large proportion of carbon emissions. For North Lincolnshire Council, one key element of reducing emissions is the WorkSmart programme, which encourages flexible working methods. One of its key aims is to reduce the carbon footprint.

Many other workplaces could also play a role in reducing emissions through redesigning working practices and examining the commuting habits of employees. One low cost method of reducing congestion and emissions is via car-sharing schemes. North Lincolnshire Council works in partnership with North East Lincolnshire Council to support a local scheme called Travellincs, which forms part of the national liftshare network. Whilst this is positive, members feel that there is scope to publicise this further, encouraging individuals and companies to consider car sharing.

The panel notes with enthusiasm the projections for increases in opportunities for green technology and industry within North Lincolnshire and the Humber region. As this report was being finalised, Able UK announced plans for a Marine Energy Park at the South Humber Gateway. This scheme is of national significance, and could potentially offer around 5,100 jobs, major inward investment and a considerable increase in the production of sustainable energy. The panel is keen to ensure that, as far as possible, the proposed Marine Energy Park and other environmental and green schemes benefit local people. Related to this, the panel also

supports the endeavours of North Lincolnshire Council in seeking a Humberside Local Economic Partnership, in co-operation with local businesses and other key partners.

The panel notes the leadership and specialist knowledge provided by the Carbon Management Group and the Climate Change Steering Group. However, the panel also sees the engagement of all individual teams across the council as crucial to meeting the requirements of the Carbon Management Plan.

The panel would wish to see each service's Culture Improvement Team take responsibility for environmental issues within their area of work. Through the regular provision of data on fuel and energy usage, recycling and paper usage rates, etc. Culture Improvement Teams can suggest methods of reducing these and help implement necessary changes.

APPENDIX

Membership of the Economic Development and Corporate issues Scrutiny Panel

Cllr Jawaid MBE (Chair)

Cllr Glover (Vice-Chairman)

Cllr Bainbridge

Cllr Barkworth

Cllr Ellerby

Cllr Poole

Cllr Wardle

The following members were also involved in this scrutiny review

Cllr Ali

Cllr Berry

Cllr Bunyan

Cllr Davison

Cllr T Foster

Cllr Smith (former Chair)

